FILED
04/18/2023
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: D'Ann CIGLER
41H-1132-R-2023

Nordlund, Julia

2.00

Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION GALLATIN RIVER BASIN (41H) PRELIMINARY DECREE

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

CLAIMANTS: Schapp Living Trust; Anne M. Doornbos

CASE 41H-1132-R-2023 41H 140888-00 41H140890-00 41H 148655-00

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Claims 41H 140888-00, 41H 140890-00, and 41H 148655-00 appeared in the Preliminary Decree for Basin 41H with Montana Department of Natural Resources and Conservation (DNRC) issue remarks.
 - 2. The claims did not receive objections or notices of intent to appear.
 - 3. The claims were consolidated into case 41H-1132-R-2023.
- 4. These claims received an issue remark stating they share a Notice of Appropriation and the flow rate from that Appropriation has been exceeded.
- 5. These claims are all filed rights based on the same Notice of Appropriation filed by Robert Wills on August 26, 1891. Mr. Wills claimed 25 miners inches. The multiple use of claim 41H 140888-00 and 140890-00 claim the full amount of the Notice of Appropriation. Claim 41H 148655-00 also claims the full amount of the Notice of Appropriation.
- 6. Claim 41H 148655-00 has an additional issue remark which needs to be resolved stating:

LOCATION OF THE HEADGATE AND DITCH COULD NOT BE IDENTIFIED FROM CURRENT INFORMATION. THERE DOES NOT APPEAR TO BE A DITCH OFF OF LITTLE BRIDGER CREEK CONVEYING WATER TO THE PLACE OF USE IN THE CLAIMED LEGAL LAND DESCRIPTION.

- 7. Claimant Anne Doornbos was given until March 2, 2023 to resolve this point of diversion issue. The Court stated if nothing is filed by the deadline, the Master may dismiss the claim. Nothing was filed.
- 8. The Court can find no evidence to show the existence of a ditch or point of diversion from the Little Bridger Creek to the S2SE Sec. 9, Twp. 2S, Rge. 6E.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Montana Water Court has the authority to resolve issue remarks when the claim file and information available to the Court provide a sufficient basis to do so. Section 85-2-248(3), MCA.
- 2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that an element of the prima facie claim is incorrect. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.
- 3. The degree or weight of evidence needed to contradict or overcome the prima facie proof statute is a preponderance of the evidence. *Burkhartsmeyer et al. v. Burkhartsmeyer et al.*, Case 40G-2, (MT Water Court Memorandum Opinion and Order Adopting Master's Report, Mar. 11, 1997). The Montana Supreme Court has defined preponderance as "a relatively modest standard that the statutory criteria are 'more probable than not' to have been met." *Hohenlohe v. State*, 2010 MT 203 ¶ 33, 357 Mont. 438, 240 P.3d 628.
- 4. The Montana Water Court is permitted to use information submitted by the Department of Natural Resources and Conservation, the statement of claim, information from approved compacts, and any other data obtained by the Court to evaluate water right claims. Section 85-2-231(2), MCA.
- 5. The issues raised by issue remarks must be resolved as part of the adjudication process pursuant to Section 85-2-248, MCA.
- 6. If a claimant, objector, or intervenor fails to appear at a scheduled conference or hearing, or fails to comply with an order issued by the water court, the water court, upon motion, or its own initiative, may issue such orders of sanction with regard thereto as are just. Rule 22, W.R.Adj.R.
- 7. Pursuant to Section 85-2-248(9), MCA, and Rule 22, W.R.Adj.R., when a claimant fails to comply with an Order issued by the Water Court, including an Order issued by a Water Master appointed by the Court, the Court, upon motion, or its own

initiative, can among other actions: 1) amend the elements of the claim to conform with the information in the claim file or information obtained by the Court, or 2) terminate the claim.

- 8. Claimant Anne Doornbos failed to provide any evidence that this claim 41H 148655-00 has a functioning point of diversion and ditch from Little Bridger Creek to the place of use. The statement of claim also duplicates the Notice of Appropriation from claims 41H 140888-00 and 41H 140890-00.
- 9. These facts combined with the lack of participation from Claimants are enough to justify a dismissal of the claim 41H 148655-00.
- 10. The dismissal of claim 41H 148655-00 resolves the notice of appropriation exceeded issue on the remaining claims.
- 11. For the above-mentioned reasons, the claims in this case should be modified as shown on the attached abstracts to resolve all issue remarks and to accurately reflect historical use.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon the above Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, this Master recommends that the Court make the changes specified above to correct the Preliminary Decree for this Basin. Post Decree Abstracts of Water Right Claims are served with this Report to confirm that the recommended changes have been made in the state's centralized record system.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service via USPS Mail:

Anne M. Doornbos PO Box 6101 Bozeman, MT 59771-6101

Schaap Living Trust Robert L. & Vivian Schaap 261 Story Hill Rd Bozeman, MT 59715-9640

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

GALLATIN RIVER

BASIN 41H

Water Right Number: 41H 140888-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: SCHAAP LIVING TRUST

ROBERT L & VIVIAN SCHAAP

261 STORY HILL RD

BOZEMAN, MT 59715 9640

Priority Date: MAY 28, 1891

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: LITTLE BRIDGER CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 N2SESE 9 2S 6E GALLATIN

Period of Diversion: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Diversion Means: LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE

Period of Use: JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31

Place of Use:

IDAcresGovt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCounty1N2SESE92S6EGALLATIN

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

140888-00 140890-00

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

GALLATIN RIVER

BASIN 41H

Water Right Number: 41H 140890-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: SCHAAP LIVING TRUST

ROBERT L & VIVIAN SCHAAP

261 STORY HILL RD

BOZEMAN, MT 59715 9640

Priority Date: MAY 28, 1891

Type of Historical Right: FILED

Purpose (use): IRRIGATION

Irrigation Type: SPRINKLER/FLOOD

Flow Rate: 282.74 GPM

Volume: THE TOTAL VOLUME OF THIS WATER RIGHT SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT

TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

Climatic Area: 4 - MODERATELY LOW

Maximum Acres: 20.00

Source Name: LITTLE BRIDGER CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

<u>ID</u> <u>Govt Lot</u> <u>Qtr Sec</u> <u>Sec</u> <u>Twp</u> <u>Rge</u> <u>County</u> 1 NESESE 9 2S 6E GALLATIN

Period of Diversion: MAY 1 TO OCTOBER 31

Diversion Means: PUMP/HEADGATE W/DITCH OR PIPELINE/FLOOD AND DIKE

Period of Use: MAY 1 TO OCTOBER 31

Place of Use:

IDAcresGovt LotQtr SecSecTwpRgeCounty120.00N2SESE92S6EGALLATIN

Total: 20.00

Remarks:

THE WATER RIGHTS FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE SUPPLEMENTAL WHICH MEANS THE RIGHTS HAVE OVERLAPPING PLACES OF USE. THE RIGHTS CAN BE COMBINED TO IRRIGATE ONLY OVERLAPPING PARCELS. EACH RIGHT IS LIMITED TO THE FLOW RATE AND PLACE OF USE OF THAT INDIVIDUAL RIGHT. THE SUM TOTAL VOLUME OF THESE WATER RIGHTS SHALL NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT PUT TO HISTORICAL AND BENEFICIAL USE.

140890-00 140891-00

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

140888-00 140890-00

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

GALLATIN RIVER

BASIN 41H

Water Right Number: 41H 148655-00 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 3 -- POST DECREE

Status: DISMISSED

Owners: ANNE M DOORNBOS

PO BOX 6101

BOZEMAN, MT 59771 6101

Priority Date:

Type of Historical Right:

Purpose (use): IRRIGATION

Flow Rate:

Volume:

Source Name: LITTLE BRIDGER CREEK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

Period of Use:

Place of Use:

Remarks:

THIS CLAIM WAS DISMISSED BY ORDER OF THE WATER COURT.